

Chemical Cost Comparison of a Conventional Deaerator vs a Liqui-Cel® Membrane Contactor System



Mixed bed ion exchange is often used to polish Reverse Osmosis (RO) permeate in many industrial water systems. This process has been utilized for several years and it is well known that the management of the dissolved Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) in the water is critical for an efficient operation.

CO₂ typically accounts for the largest anion

load in a DI system and it is normally handled using one of the following methods:

- 1) Conventional degasifying unit, such as a Forced Draft Tower
- 2) Liqui-Cel® Membrane Contactors

This technical brief compares the performance and operating costs of membrane contactors with conventional forced draft tower technology for CO₂ removal. This brief will also show why membrane

degassing is the economical and value added technology of choice for oxygen and carbon dioxide removal from water.

This comparison is based on an actual water system currently operating at a plant in China. The system consists of three 110 m³/hr lines each line consisting of an RO+Mixed Bed system. Due to high chemical (HCL and NaOH) regeneration costs the plant considered deaerating the water prior to the Mixed Bed. The plant evaluated two system designs:

RO+Forced Draft Degassing Tower+Mixed Bed and RO+Liqui-Cel® +Mixed Bed.

Lanxess' Lewatit 4.17 software was used to size the mixed-beds and calculate the chemical consumption for three 110m³/hr system designs:

- 1) RO+Mixed Bed (Current System)
- 2) RO+Forced Draft Tower+Mixed Bed
- 3) RO+Liqui-Cel®+Mixed Bed

The software was validated by comparing the actual chemical consumption at the plant to the chemical consumption calculated by the software. The calculation was verified as matching the actual operating consumption.

Table 1: Mixed Bed Regeneration Chemical Consumption Per Cycle

System Configuration	Outlet CO ₂	MB Size	MB Gross Product Water	Net Volume	Chemical Consumption per Cycle		Neutralization HCL Consumption
					30% HCL (Kg)	100% NaOH	30% HCL
Without CO ₂ Removal	20 ppm	D2700xH3700	2755 m ³ (727,794 gal)	2640 m ³ (697,414 gal)	860	516	556
With CO ₂ Removal (FDA Removal)	8 ppm	D2400xH3350	2723 m ³ (719,341 gal)	2640 m ³ (697,414 gal)	620	372	450
With CO ₂ Removal (Liqui-Cel)	1.5 ppm	D2100xH3300	2702 m ³ (713,793 gal)	2640 m ³ (697,414 gal)	466	278	376

Notes:

- 1) Forced Draft Tower outlet CO₂ was set as 8.0 ppm taking into account seasonal temperature fluctuations impacting the towers performance in cooler weather.
- 2) Liqui-Cel® CO₂ outlet was set at 1.5 ppm to reduce capital costs of the system. Lower CO₂ outlets are achievable and may be considered depending on the needs of the plant.

As shown in table 2 the chemical cost savings of using a membrane system are over 120,000 RMB (17,593 USD) per year compared to a traditional deaeration system. This figure does not even include the added costs associated with waste water treatment and additional water required to operate the larger IX systems. There can also be additional capital cost savings because a smaller mixed bed system can be considered.

Membrane systems also have additional value added benefits to consider. The membrane acts as a barrier between the gas and liquid phase. This prevents particles and other contaminants in the air from contaminating the RO permeate. This is especially important in an environment where a deaerator may not be practical due to ambient air contamination. The membrane system is also modular and can be easily expanded to meet plant water demand growth.

Table 2: Chemical Costs Per 110 m³/hr System

System Configuration	30% HCL Consumption (metric ton)	HCL Cost ¹ RMB (USD) ³	NaOH Consumption ² (metric ton)	NaOH Cost RMB (USD)	Total Regeneration Cost ⁴ RMB (USD)	Total Yearly Regeneration Cost ⁴ RMB (USD)
Without CO2 Removal	1.416	878 (129)	0.516	1032 (151)	1910 (280)	697,150 (102,209)
With CO2 Removal (FDA Removal)	1.070	663 (97)	0.372	744 (109)	1407 (206)	513,555 (75,292)
With CO2 Removal (Liqui-Cel)	0.842	522 (75)	0.278	556 (82)	1078 (158)	393,470 (57,686)

Notes:

- 1) HCl costs based on 620 RMB/metric ton (\$91/metric ton)
- 2) NaOH costs based on 2000 RMB/metric ton (\$293/ metric ton)
- 3) Conversion rate for RMB to USD was 0.14661 on 11/2008
- 4) Total costs are based on 365 days/year

This product is to be used only by persons familiar with its use. It must be maintained within the stated limitations. All sales are subject to Seller's terms and conditions. Purchaser assumes all responsibility for the suitability and fitness for use as well as for the protection of the environment and for health and safety involving this product. Seller reserves the right to modify this document without prior notice. Check with your representative to verify the latest update. To the best of our knowledge the information contained herein is accurate. However, neither Seller nor any of its affiliates assumes any liability whatsoever for the accuracy or completeness of the information contained herein. Final determination of the suitability of any material and whether there is any infringement of patents, trademarks, or copyrights is the sole responsibility of the user. Users of any substance should satisfy themselves by independent investigation that the material can be used safely. We may have described certain hazards, but we cannot guarantee that these are the only hazards that exist.

Liqui-Cel, Celgard, SuperPhobic and MiniModule are registered trademarks of Membrana-Charlotte, A division of Celgard, LLC and nothing herein shall be construed as a recommendation or license to use any information that conflicts with any patent, trademark or copyright of Seller or others.

©2010 Membrana – Charlotte A Division of Celgard, LLC

(TB68 rev1_1-10)

Membrana - Charlotte
 A Division of Celgard, LLC
 13800 South Lakes Drive
 Charlotte, North Carolina 28273 USA
 Phone: (704) 587 8888
 Fax: (704) 587 8585

Membrana GmbH
 Oehder Strasse 28
 42289 Wuppertal
 Germany
 Phone: +49 202 6099 - 658
 Phone: +49 6126 2260 - 41
 Fax: +49 202 6099 -750

Japan Office
 Shinjuku Mitsui Building, 27F
 1-1, Nishishinjuku 2-chome
 Shinjuku-ku, Tokyo 163-0427
 Japan
 Phone: 81 3 5324 3361
 Fax: 81 3 5324 3369

MEMBRANA
 Underlining Performance

www.liqui-cel.com

A **POLYPORE** Company